

Title:

Rethinking Bernard Williams' Criticism of the City-Soul Analogy in Plato's *Republic*

Abstract:

This essay takes a close look at Bernard Williams' criticism of the city-soul analogy in Plato's *Republic*, which "has dominated the discussion of its subject ever since." (Myles Burnyeat). I will start with reviving Williams' arguments to elucidate the genuine challenge to Plato's theory of justice by introducing city-soul analogy. The second part of this essay aims to show that Williams' own critics, such as Jonathan Lear, G.R.F. Ferrari, and Nobert Blössner, have not successfully solved the problems Williams brought forth in his article. Finally, I will call attention to a neglected aspect of the city-soul analogy, i.e. the predominance of reason in Plato's theory of justice. By carefully analyzing Plato's account of justice and briefly addressing the discussion about philosopher-kings in Book V-VII, I will argue that Plato actually defines justice as the rule of the reasoning part. With this new definition of justice, the city-soul analogy will be shown philosophically accountable within the whole argumentative structure of *Republic*.

Bibliography

Julia Annas, *An Introduction to Plato's Republic*, Oxford, 1981.

Nobert Blössner, *Dialogform und Argument: Studien zu Platons 'Politeia'*, Stuttgart, 1997.

-----, "The City-Soul Analogy", in *The Cambridge Companion to Plato's Republic*, ed. G.R.F. Ferrari, Cambridge, 2007, 345-385.

Christoph Bobonich, *Plato's Utopia Recast: His Later Ethics and Politics*, Cambridge, 2002.

Myles Burnyeat, "Utopia and Fantasy: The Practicability of Plato's Ideally Just City", in *Plato 2: Ethics, Politics, Religion, and the Soul*, ed. G Fine, Oxford, 1999, 297-308.

J.M. Cooper, "The Psychology of Justice in Plato", *American Philosophical Quarterly*

14 (1977): 151-57.

G. R. F. Ferrari, *City and Soul in Plato's Republic*, Chicago and London, 2005.

-----, "The Three-Part Soul", in *The Cambridge Companion to Plato's Republic*, Cambridge, 2007, 165-201.

Otfried Höffe, "Zur Analogie von Individuum und Polis", in *Platon: Politeia*, hrsg. von O. Höffe, Berlin, 1997, 69-94.

Terence Irwin, *Plato's Ethics*, New York & Oxford, 1995.

-----, "The Parts of the Soul and the Cardinal Virtues," in *Platon: Politeia*, hrsg. von O. Höffe, Berlin, 1997, 119-139.

Jonathan Lear, "Inside and Outside the *Republic*," *Phronesis* 37 (1992): 184-215.

Jessica Moss, "Appearances and Calculations: Plato's Division of the Soul", in *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy*, vol. XXXIV (2008), 35-68.

David Sachs, "A Fallacy in Plato's *Republic*", *Philosophical Review*, 72 (1963): 141-58.

Karel Thein, "Justice dans la cite et justice en l'âme: une analogie imparfaite," in *Études sur la République de Platon* vol. 1, Paris, 2005, 247-264.

Gregory Vlastos, "Justice and Happiness in the *Republic*", in id. *Platonic Studies*, second printing with corrections, Princeton, 1981, 111-139.

Bernard Williams, "The Analogy of City and Soul in Plato's *Republic*" reprinted in *The Sense of the Past: Essays in the History of Philosophy*, ed. Myles Burnyeat, Princeton and Oxford, 2006.

J.R.S. Wilson, "The Argument of *Republic IV*", *The Philosophical Quarterly*, 26 (1976), 111-124.

**Information about the author:**

**Name:** Tianyue Wu

**Affiliation:**

Institute of Foreign Philosophy

Department of Philosophy

Peking University (China)

**Contact Address:**

Tianyue Wu

Department of Philosophy

Peking University

100871 Beijing

China, P. R.

**Tel:** 00861062758286

**Email address:** [wutianyue@gmail.com](mailto:wutianyue@gmail.com)

**Fax:** 00861062755273

**Preference of format:** a shorter presentation in a parallel session